

LDC Argumentative Writing - Student Work Samples - Social Studies - Grades 11-12

Scroll down to view two authentic pieces of student work that resulted from this 11-12th Grade Social Studies LDC Real Works assignment:

After reading primary sources on the U.S. annexation of Hawaii, write a causal analysis in which you argue the extent to which the sources' perspectives on imperialism influenced the annexation of Hawaii. Support your position with evidence from the text/s.

After each piece of student work, you will also find how each one was scored using the associated [rubric](#), and you will also find a written rationale for each score.

Annexation of Hawaii

The annexation of Hawaii was not an easy undertaking for the citizens of Hawaii or United States politicians. The various views of Imperialism by the Queen, the Hawaiian citizens, and United States politicians made the process of annexation lengthy. The Queen desired to make the monarchy stronger when she took over from her brother in 1891. Hawaiian native citizens opposed what they saw as a takeover by the United States even though many United States citizens living in Hawaii were pushing for the annexation. Although President Cleveland was against American Imperialism and the annexation in 1893, President McKinley and members of Congress approved the annexation in 1898. Throughout the seven year period between when the Queen took over the Hawaiian monarchy and the actual resolution to annex Hawaii, there were many differences of opinion.

When Queen Lili'uokalani took over the Hawaiian monarchy in 1891 she began to push for strengthening the Constitution in Hawaii by only letting native Hawaiian citizens to vote and having her sign all legislation. A group of citizens called The Hawaiian League overthrew the Queen and established a provisional government called the Republic of Hawaii. They were helped by the U.S. military. Years later when the annexation was about to happen the Queen came to present a petition to the United States Senate from a group called the Hawaiian Patriotic League. In the primary source entitled "Liliuokalani Talks," from **he McCoo ri une**, June 25, 1897, she states, "Fifteen hundred people are giving away my country." She refers to this group as Americans who settled in Hawaii and who wanted Hawaii to be a part of the United States. She also says that no provision was made for her upkeep and that her native citizens would want her taken care of. Although the Queen was against the annexation, there were

citizens in Hawaii who were both for and against Hawaii becoming part of the United States.

The citizens in Hawaii who were for annexation were mostly Americans or citizens who weren't native Hawaiians. They realized that there would be a stronger government and military help in times of war if Hawaii was part of the United States. They also felt that the Queen's push to let only Hawaiian natives vote and her wish to sign all laws made them vulnerable with no representation. At the same time, there were other citizens, many native Hawaiians, who were loyal to the monarchy and felt that American imperialism was taking away their government and their culture. They were called the Hawaiian Patriotic League and they and many others signed the petition that was brought to Washington D.C. in 1897. The citizens of Hawaii were both for and against annexation while the same thing was going on in the United States in the years leading up to the actual annexation.

After the provisional government was set up when the monarch was overthrown during a coup in 1893, President Grover Cleveland came out arguing against American Imperialism and the act of overthrowing the government in Hawaii. He delivered a message in December, 1893, to the American people stating that he did not believe that taking over another country was one of America's ideals. According to Cleveland, it appeared that the takeover was "zealously promoted by the Minister representing the United States" in Hawaii. He further states that the minister "evidently had an ardent desire that it should become a fact accomplished by his agency and during his ministry and was not inconveniently scrupulous as to the means employed to that end." Although he said he realized the importance of the sugar crops and the idea of a military base, he would leave the decision to Congress. Congress did not act on annexation during his presidency although in the article, "In Favor of Annexation" in The New York Daily Tribune on Monday, January 30, 1893, several senators spoke out on the "great desirability" of annexation as the site of a naval base. It was also discussed at this time that if

annexation did not occur, perhaps the United States should pay for the islands as they did for Alaska and the Louisiana Purchase. Others spoke of the fertile land and the intelligent people. The control of the "sugar situation in the world" was also a reason for annexation. Although Congress failed to act in 1893, there continued to be efforts for the annexation. In 1898 when the Spanish American War was going on, many members of Congress and President McKinley realized that Hawaii would be important to the United States not only for its fertile land but for a military base and refueling station during the conflict. There was also worry that if Hawaii did not become part of the U.S., it might fall to Japan. The seven years from 1891 to 1898 were a time of indecision on the annexation but finally under the McKinley administration a decision was finalized.

Even though there were conflicting views on imperialism by the Hawaiian Queen, the citizens of Hawaii, and the United States politicians, an official resolution was passed by Congress and signed by President McKinley in July of 1898. In August there was an official ceremony and the Hawaiian Flag was replaced with the American Flag. The annexation of Hawaii proved to be an important step for the United States government, especially during World War II. Hawaii was not officially added as a state until 1959.

Dimension	Score	Explanation of the Score / Evidence / Rationale
Controlling Idea	2.5	The lengthy claim, "The various views of Imperialism by the Queen, the Hawaiian citizens, and United States politicians made the process of annexation lengthy. The Queen desired to make the monarchy stronger when she took over from her brother in 1891. Hawaiian native citizens opposed what they saw as a takeover by the United States even though many United States citizens living in Hawaii were pushing for the annexation. Although President Cleveland was against American Imperialism and the annexation in 1893, President McKinley and members of Congress approved the annexation in 1898" addresses the perspectives of imperialism but it does not address the causes of imperialism, which keeps it from a 3 as it does not address ALL aspects of the prompt.

Selection & Citation of Evidence	4	Body paragraphs include relevant evidence that fully support the claim. All sources are appropriately cited. Evidence supports the multiple perspectives and views on annexation - Queen Lili'uokalani, Hawaiian Citizens, and US Politicians.
Development / Explanation of Sources	4	Thoroughly explains each idea and source material using logical reasoning. "It was also discussed at this time that if annexation did not occur, perhaps the United States should pay for the islands as they did for Alaska and the Louisiana Purchase. Others spoke of the fertile land and the intelligent people. The control of the "sugar situation in the world" was also a reason for annexation. Although Congress failed to act in 1893, there continued to be efforts for the annexation. in 1898 when the Spanish American War was going on, many members of Congress and President McKinley realized that Hawaii would be important to the United States not only for its fertile land but for a military base and refueling station during the conflict. There was also worry that if Hawaii did not become part of the U.S., it might fall to Japan."
Organization	4	Ideas are sequenced in a logical progression based on perspectives on annexation. Precise relationships are established and logical conclusions are drawn from evidence. While some native Hawaiians supported annexation, others (like the Queen) opposed it.
C3 Practice: Understand Perspectives	3	Does not "consider representativeness of particular perspective OR identifies a missing perspective." While it does attempt representativeness when it says, "The citizens in Hawaii who were for annexation were mostly Americans or citizens who weren't native Hawaiians." it ultimately contradicts that statement when it goes on to say, "The citizens of Hawaii were both for and against annexation while the same thing was going on in the United States in the years leading up to the actual annexation." This then nullifies the attempt to consider representativeness.
C3 Concept: Cause and Effect	3	Explains causes ("They realized there would be a stronger government and military help in times of war if Hawaii was part of the United States" and "'great desirability' of annexation as the site of a naval base") and effects ("The annexation of Hawaii proved to be an important step for the United States government, especially during World War II.")

11-12th Grade SS RW Anchor Module - Q1 - SW19

Imperialism has made huge impacts on thousands of countries and people in the past, and even today. Hawaii and other countries were impacted by this during the annexation of Hawaii. The sources' perspectives on imperialism help exemplify and describe how patriotism, economics, and the military have influenced the annexation of Hawaii.

One source's perspective on imperialism had made it apparent that patriotism had influenced the annexation of Hawaii. Patriotism plays a big role in imperialism. Not only does it play a role in imperialism in general, but it was important during the annexation of Hawaii. In one source it states, "This is the work before you, my countrymen, and I bid you advance to it. Hand in hand may you go, you of the home race with those whose fathers' land this was, and whose generous virtues have won for them the regard of all mankind. Hand in hand, may you go with them as they carry with them their unfaltering love of country into the broad plane of American citizenship." This shows that the overwhelming pride for one's country made it easy for American citizens and legislative bodies to feel as if annexing Hawaii was a smart decision and would help the native Hawaiians feel patriotic now that they are apart of America. The decisions made leading up to the annexation were seen as if Hawaii was benefiting, but in reality the United States was simply overthrowing Hawaii.

Another sources' perspective on imperialism helped describe how economics influenced the annexation of Hawaii. Economics is always a topic of discussion and affects every country. During the annexation of Hawaii the "sugar situation" was a big deal. This includes the tariff being put on sugar. America had forced Hawaii to sign a treaty that would lower the tariffs on sugar being imported to the United States. In the source it says, "We would need them in war and we would need them in peace. Their possession would go far toward enabling us to control the sugar situation of the world." This shows that economics was a big part in imperialism and in the annexation of Hawaii.

Lastly, the sources' helped show how the military influenced the annexation of Hawaii. Military is a big part of imperialism. Using the military is one of the most efficient and easiest ways to take over a country. In this case the United States also used their military in order to annex Hawaii. For example, in the text it says, "This statement is not important, since the one controlling factor in the whole affair was unquestionably the United States Marines, who, drawn up under arms and with artillery in readiness only seventy-six yards distant, dominated the situation." This excerpt

from the text shows how the military played a part in the annexation of Hawaii.

Military, economics, and patriotism each had made a huge impact on the annexation of Hawaii. Each of them also were very important to the United States, The sources perspectives on imperialism help exemplify and describe how patriotism, economics, and the military have influenced the annexation of Hawaii.

Dimension	Score	Explanation of the Score / Evidence / Rationale
Controlling Idea	2.5	The claim “The sources' perspectives on imperialism help exemplify and describe how patriotism, economics, and the military have influenced the annexation of Hawaii.” is clear and does address the prompt with a clear focus of patriotism, economics and the military. It does not however address all aspects of the prompt as it does not identify sources' perspectives on imperialism or the extent to which the sources' perspectives influence annexation.
Selection & Citation of Evidence	2.5	Each of the three quotes support their claim of causes for imperialism being patriotism, economics and the military, but the sources are not cited except for mentioning them as one source or another source. While the citation is consistent it is incorrect and more than just a minor formatting issue.
Development / Explanation of Sources	2	The paper explains how the first source represents a patriotic reason for imperialism, but it does not for the 2nd two sources. For those two sources it begins with some general explanations of the reasons of economics and militarism, but it does not explain how the sources show that particular causes, just says that they do which is incomplete.
Organization	2.5	There is an evident structure with an introduction, three body paragraphs organized by cause and a conclusion which are grouped together to create an argument although it is not a cohesive argument. In addition transitions are used such as “one source...another source...lastly” for flow between paragraphs and each paragraph begins with context followed by a quote and ends with the attempted reasoning.
C3 Practice: Understand Perspectives	2	Response identifies some perspectives regarding annexation of Hawaii but fails to explain how these contextual factors influenced them. Broad claims are made connecting causes to perspectives, but explanations regarding influence are uneven. For example, militaries do play a role in annexation, but there is no explanation for how militarization might influence a desire for Hawaiian annexation.
C3 Concept: Cause and Effect	1.5	Causes, including patriotism, economics, and military are identified but not explained. While patriotism has some explanation, neither economics or the military have any explanation, they are just included.